



The leading global network  
of research universities  
for the 21st century

# Teaching Indicators Project

Professor Graeme Aitken, UA

Professor Stephen Marshall, UNSW

Professor Simon Bates, UCC

# Background



**2013**

## **Survey of Hot Topics in U21 Network**

Need for a common framework that could be used across the Network to guide promotion to Professor for those in teaching only/intensive positions

**2014**

## **Framework Development Project**

To analyse and assess the criteria and evidence used in U21 institutions' to evaluate teaching performance as part of promotion processes. To use these data to develop an initial framework of indicators

**2015**

## **Framework Re- Development Project**

To test the face validity of the initial framework.

To identify how it could be improved.

To revise or redevelop the framework in light of this review

**2016**

## **Framework Validation Project**

To establish the face validity – appropriateness, comprehensiveness and usefulness of the revised framework

- Survey
- Alignment of framework with original data set
- Case Study of use

**2017**

## **Indicators and Standards Project**

To develop a range of indicative descriptive indicators and standards for each dimension of teaching included in the framework that might be used to guide criteria and standards for promotion

# Framework Development Project

- Collected and analysed:
  - current promotion policies and procedures
  - promotion applications
  - teaching portfolios

to determine the nature of the indicators and evidence that were currently used across the U21 network in the promotion to the level of professor, academic staff in teaching only/focused positions

- Used these data to develop an initial proposed framework

# Data Alignment Project

Dimension of Teaching		Form of Expression		
		<b>Practitioners</b> (Do) Focus is on what an individual does in any of these dimensions of teaching <u>to facilitate and support the learning of THEIR students</u>	<b>Leaders</b> (Develop) Focus on the work the individual does to <u>influence and support OTHERS to innovate or change their practice</u> in any of these dimensions of teaching	<b>Managers</b> (Enable) Focus on the work the individual does to <u>create the ORGANISATIONAL CONDITIONS necessary to enable and support learning and the development of teaching</u> in any of these dimensions of teaching practice.
<b>Learning Facilitator</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves <u>engaging, challenging, scaffolding, supporting and providing students with feedback</u> on their learning			
<b>Educational Designer</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves <u>designing, developing and deploying resources, activities, learning support and assessment tasks within physical &amp; digital environments</u> to enable and support learning			
<b>Reflective Teacher</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves the <u>systematic collection &amp; analysis of evidence to inform ongoing efforts to assure and improve</u> the quality of teaching			
<b>Scholarly Teacher</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves <u>engaging with and contributing to the scholarship</u> of learning and teaching			

# Example of Mapping

Dimension of Teaching		Form of Expression		
		<i>Practitioners</i> (Do) Focus is on what an individual does in any of these dimensions of teaching <u>to facilitate and support the learning of THEIR students</u>	<i>Leaders</i> (Develop) Focus on the work the individual does to <u>influence and support OTHERS to innovate or change their practice</u> in any of these dimensions of teaching	<i>Managers</i> (Enable) Focus on the work the individual does to <u>create the ORGANISATIONAL CONDITIONS necessary to enable and support learning and the development of teaching</u> in any of these dimensions of teaching practice.
<b>Reflective Teacher</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves the <u>systematic collection &amp; analysis of evidence to inform ongoing efforts to assure and improve</u> the quality of teaching	<p>Evidence of changes in student achievement.</p> <p>Evidence of changes to practice as a result of peer observation.</p> <p>Explaining the impact of a professional development programme on own teaching.</p> <p>Peer critique of teaching materials.</p> <p>Benchmarking course against similar courses to improve content and delivery.</p>	<p><b>Membership of, and contribution to, a Faculty committee on teaching and learning.</b></p> <p>Reviewing colleagues teaching.</p> <p>Create artifacts that illustrate the value of teaching and share with colleagues.</p> <p>Invitation to judge a teaching competition in own faculty/university.</p> <p>Invitation to judge a national/international teaching competition.</p>	<p>Contributing to/organising departmental reviews of teaching and programmes.</p> <p>Bringing together a group of colleagues to discuss teaching – brown bag lunch.</p> <p>Contribution to policy change in faculty, university as it relates to teaching and learning in high education.</p> <p>Evidence of improvements in teaching and learning in a role as a Director of Teaching or as a Head of Department or as a Chair of a Board of Studies.</p> <p><b>Contribution to policy change in teaching and learning at national level.</b></p> <p><b>Contribution to change in teaching policies at faculty or university level.</b></p> <p><b>Contribution to policy change in a public body as it relates to teaching and learning in high education.</b></p>

# Outcomes of the Data Alignment Project

Proposed U21 Framework for <u>Conceptualising 21<sup>st</sup> Century Teaching</u>				
Dimension of Teaching <b>85</b>		Form of Expression		
		<i>Practitioners</i> (Do) Focus is on what an individual does in any of these dimensions of teaching <b>to facilitate and support the learning of THEM students</b>	<i>Leaders</i> (Develop) Focus on the work the individual does to <b>influence and support OTHERS to innovate or change their practice</b> in any of these dimensions of teaching	<i>Managers</i> (Enable) Focus on the work the individual does to <b>create the ORGANISATIONAL CONDITIONS</b> necessary to enable and support learning and the <b>development of teaching</b> in any of these dimensions of teaching practice.
<i>Learning Facilitator</i>	That dimension of teaching that involves <b>engaging, challenging, scaffolding, supporting and providing students with feedback</b> on their learning	<b>11</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>10</b>
<i>Educational Designer</i>	That dimension of teaching that involves <b>designing, developing and deploying resources, activities, learning support and assessment tasks within physical &amp; digital environments</b> to enable and support learning	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>
<i>Reflective Teacher</i>	That dimension of teaching that involves the <b>systematic collection &amp; analysis of evidence to inform ongoing efforts to assure and improve</b> the quality of teaching	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>7</b>
<i>Scholarly Teacher</i>	That dimension of teaching that involves <b>engaging with and contributing to the scholarship</b> of learning and teaching	<b>4</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>8</b>

Dimension of Teaching		Form of Expression		
		<b>Practitioners</b> (Do) Focus is on what an individual does in any of these dimensions of teaching <b><u>to facilitate and support the learning of THEIR students</u></b>	<b>Leaders</b> (Develop) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><u>influence and support OTHERS to innovate or change their practice</u></b> in any of these dimensions of teaching	<b>Managers</b> (Enable) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><u>create the ORGANISATIONAL CONDITIONS necessary to enable and support learning and the development of teaching</u></b> in any of these dimensions of teaching practice.
<b>Learning Facilitator</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves <b><u>engaging, challenging, scaffolding, supporting and providing students with feedback</u></b> on their learning	A written statement about approach to teaching and reasons for that approach.  Sustained successful teaching as evidenced by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Student results and responses</li> <li>Peer critique</li> <li>Graduate student awards</li> </ul> Distinguished subsequent achievements by graduate students.  Winning an award for teaching and learning – department, faculty  Winning a Teaching Fellowship	<b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Leading a step change in teaching  Contribution to national/ international teaching activity  Leading training with stakeholders to develop internships, practicum, industry experience	<b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Initiating student support: peer mentoring, CoPs, tutor training  Course and programme coordination and administration  Managing a new approach to teaching and learning at Department/ Faculty level

Dimension of Teaching		Form of Expression			
		<b>Practitioners</b> (Do) Focus is on what an individual does in any of these dimensions of teaching <b><u>to facilitate and support the learning of THEIR students</u></b>	<b>Leaders</b> (Develop) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><u>influence and support OTHERS to innovate or change their practice</u></b> in any of these dimensions of teaching	<b>Managers</b> (Enable) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><u>create the ORGANISATIONAL CONDITIONS necessary to enable and support learning and the development of teaching</u></b> in any of these dimensions of teaching practice.	
<b>Educational Designer</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves <b><u>designing, developing and deploying resources, activities, learning support and assessment tasks within physical &amp; digital environments</u></b> to enable and support learning	<p>Examples of course materials – annotated to...</p> <p>de</p> <p>Us</p> <p>sin</p> <p>Re</p> <p>MO</p> <p>Re</p> <p>ass</p> <p>an</p> <p>Pu</p> <p>Ex</p> <p>Ex</p>	<p><b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Converting course to new forms of delivery</p> <p>Re-design in response to student feedback</p> <p>Team and cross-disciplinary teaching</p>	<p><b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Converting programme to new forms of delivery</p> <p>Leading major curriculum review</p> <p>Teaching materials adopted by others – textbook, YouTube</p>	<p><b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Coordinating a clinical/professional programme</p> <p>Coordinating a programme review</p> <p>Coordinating team or cross-disciplinary teaching</p>



Dimension of Teaching		Form of Expression		
		<b>Practitioners</b> (Do) Focus is on what an individual does in any of these dimensions of teaching <b><u>to facilitate and support the learning of THEIR students</u></b>	<b>Leaders</b> (Develop) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><u>influence and support OTHERS to innovate or change their practice</u></b> in any of these dimensions of teaching	<b>Managers</b> (Enable) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><u>create the ORGANISATIONAL CONDITIONS necessary to enable and support learning and the development of teaching in</u></b> any of these dimensions of teaching practice.
<b>Reflective Teacher</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves the <b><u>systematic collection &amp; analysis of evidence to inform ongoing efforts to assure and improve</u></b> the quality of teaching	Evidence of changes in student <b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Changes in practice  Changes in outcomes for students  Benchmarking and peer critique for improvement	Membership of, and contribution to, a <b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Contribution as a member of a faculty/university teaching and learning committee  Reviewing others' teaching  Judging teaching competitions	Contributing to/organising departmental <b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Facilitating collegial discussions about teaching  Facilitating improvements in teaching as Head of Department, Chair of a Board of Studies  Contribution to policy change

Dimension of Teaching		Form of Expression		
		<b>Practitioners</b> (Do) Focus is on what an individual does in any of these dimensions of teaching <b><i>to facilitate and support the learning of THEIR students</i></b>	<b>Leaders</b> (Develop) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><i>influence and support OTHERS to innovate or change their practice</i></b> in any of these dimensions of teaching	<b>Managers</b> (Enable) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><i>create the ORGANISATIONAL CONDITIONS necessary to enable and support learning and the development of teaching</i></b> in any of these dimensions of teaching practice.
<b>Scholarly Teacher</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves <b><i>engaging with and contributing to the scholarship</i></b> of learning and teaching	Completion of a qualification in teaching. <b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Undertaking professional development on teaching and learning  Completion of a qualification on teaching and learning  In-house publications on teaching	External examiner for postgraduate research, thesis/dissertation <b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Peer-reviewed publications on teaching and learning  Invitations/ consultancy on teaching and learning – master classes, keynotes, visiting professorships, external examining  Media contributions on teaching and learning  Consultancy on teaching and learning.	Organising sharing of case studies of teaching practice <b>Evidence about/ from:</b> Organising a teaching and learning showcase/TedX  Organising a conference on teaching and learning  Commercialisation of a scholarly output on teaching and learning  Scholarship or teaching output – e.g. online resources or programme

Dimension of Teaching		Form of Expression		
		<b>Practitioners</b> (Do) Focus is on what an individual does in any of these dimensions of teaching <b><u>to facilitate and support the learning of THEIR students</u></b>	<b>Leaders</b> (Develop) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><u>influence and support OTHERS to innovate or change their practice</u></b> in any of these dimensions of teaching	<b>Managers</b> (Enable) Focus on the work the individual does to <b><u>create the ORGANISATIONAL CONDITIONS necessary to enable and support learning and the development of teaching</u></b> in any of these dimensions of teaching practice.
<b>Learning Facilitator</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves <b><u>engaging, challenging, scaffolding, supporting and providing students with feedback</u></b> on their learning	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Student results and responses  Peer critique  Graduate student awards	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Leading a step change in teaching  Contribution to national/ international teaching activity  Leading training with stakeholders	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Initiating student support processes  Course and programme coordination  Managing a new approach to teaching
<b>Educational Designer</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves <b><u>designing, developing and deploying resources, activities, learning support and assessment tasks within physical &amp; digital environments</u></b> to enable and support learning	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Converting course to new forms of delivery  Re-design in response to student feedback  Team and cross-disciplinary teaching	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Converting programme to new forms of delivery  Leading major curriculum review  Teaching materials adopted by others – textbook, YouTube	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Coordinating a clinical/ professional programme  Coordinating a programme review  Coordinating team or cross-disciplinary teaching
<b>Reflective Teacher</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves the <b><u>systematic collection &amp; analysis of evidence to inform ongoing efforts to assure and improve</u></b> the quality of teaching	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Changes in practice  Changes in outcomes for students  Benchmarking and peer critique	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> T&L Committee contribution  Reviewing others' teaching  Judging teaching competitions	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Facilitating collegial T&L discussions  Facilitating improvements in teaching  Contribution to T&L policy change
<b>Scholarly Teacher</b>	That dimension of teaching that involves <b><u>engaging with and contributing to the scholarship</u></b> of learning and teaching	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Personal professional development  Qualification  In-house publications	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Peer-reviewed publications  Invited consultancies and keynotes  Media contributions	<b>Evidence about/from:</b> Organising a T&L showcase/TedX  Organising a T&L conference  Commercialisation of a scholarly teaching output

# Outcomes of the Alignment Project



- The proposed framework aligns with the criteria, indicators and evidence used in existing promotion processes in U21 institutions